****

**5 IQA Indicators and Implementation methods**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **IQA** **Domain 1** | **No.**  | **IQA Indicator**  | **Indicator Metric**  | **Benchmark**  | **Implementation Method** | **Target** | **Comments** |
| ***Teaching &*** ***Learning*** | ***Performance Indicators*** |  |  |
| 1.  | Qualification of academic staff  | Level at hiring  | Only Master qualified or above faculty. At least 30% or more PhD qualified with both research and teaching competencies in hiring. A good mix of academic (+/-70) and professional (+/-30) qualification and experience. Must meet at least the national and any preferred international accreditation requirements. | Policy & procedures |  |  |
| 2.  | Pedagogical talent  | Pedagogical diplomas at hiring Student Evaluations score Peer Evaluation score | Majority of the faculty (≥70%) members should have a certification in HE teaching & learning or willing to do it within two years. A minimum of 2 (two) in house faculty development programme activities and at least 70% faculty should attend them. |
| 3.  | Research based teaching  | No./quality of research in required/recommended literature | 2 to 5 (two to five) recent (i.e. from last 5 years) scientific research publications must be used in each course/module (70% of each programme curriculum). |
| 4.  | Teaching methods (innovative teaching formats) | No./quality of methods in use  | All faculty members should bring at least one new/innovative pedagogies and dialectical methods  |

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 11 -



|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |  | for covering all learning styles especially for the new student generations. |  |  |  |
| 5.  | Teaching & learning facilities (technologically advanced tools) | Level (quality) of facilities  | A virtual learning environment (VLE) Softwares available for students e.g. SPSS, STATA, Atlas.ti. Online Library access to books, journals, publications e.g EBSCO, Pearson, Perlego, etc. |
| 6.  | Level of transparency: peer evaluations, sharing best practices among staff | No./type of peer evaluation activities | 1 (one) voluntary peer evaluation 1 (one) or multiple sharing of best practices event organised |
| 7.  | Facilitation of experiential learning: work-placements | No. of work-placement opportunities (though curriculum) & their management | Each programme having a work placement embedded in the curriculum |
| 8.  | Collaboration with the industry: guest-speakers | No. of guest speakers per course | in. 1 (one) guest speaker/course |
| 9.  | Life-long learning: teacher trainings | No. of teachers in trainings organised | 1-2 (one or two) teacher trainings available at the school 20% of teachers to participate in mobility project |
| 10.  | Internationalisation  | Projects (mobility) No. of teaching staff or students in mobility Size of the international department | 1-2 projects enhancing internationalisation and teaching staff and student mobility |  |  |  |
| ***Perceptual Indicators*** |  |  |
| 11.  | Quality of teaching  | Student feedback on teaching, teaching methods, facilities, etc. | Each course to have a evaluation moment | Course Evaluations National Surveys Education Fair (other events with similar scope) |  |  |

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 12 -



|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |  |  | Teacher Awards |
| 12.  | Quality of education  | Student feedback on education in general provided at the HEI, programme evaluations | 1 (one) yearly conducted general survey with the students (this can be a National Survey as well) | Course Evaluation Programme Evaluations National Surveys |
| 13.  | Quality of learning process (internships, mobility, etc. | Satisfaction with cooperating business partners, satisfaction with work-placements, satisfaction with study mobility | Semi-annually or annually conducted surveys | Student Evaluations National Surveys |
| 14.  | Quality of students  | Teacher feedback on student performance and quality Employer feedback on interns, alumni performance and quality | Semi-annually or annually conducted surveys | Teacher/Staff Survey Employer Survey Education Fair (other events with similar scope) |
| 15.  | Quality of professional development | Staff/teacher feedback  | Annually conducted surveys  | Teacher/Staff Survey Teacher Peer Reviews |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **IQA** **Domain 2** | **No.**  | **IQA Indicator**  | **Indicator Metric**  | **Benchmark**  | **Implementation Method** | **Targets** | **Comments** |
| ***Assess*** ***ments*** | ***Performance Indicators*** |  |  |
| 2.  | Rules/guidelines  | Presence of clear instructions for assessment development | An Educational Guide | Policy & procedures |  |  |
| 2.  | Admin efficiency  | Presence of clear procedures around assessments & feedback for students and staff | An Administrational Guide |
| 3.  | Meeting the learning objectives  | Alignment of learning goals and objectives with the assessed learning goals and objectives | An Assurance of learning process |
| 4.  | Assessment methods  | Appropriate and effective methods of assessment | An Examination Handbook |

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 13 -



|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 5.  | Quality control mechanisms  | Presence of quality control of assessments in the form of a committee, answer key reviews, etc. | A Quality System Handbook |  |
| ***Perceptual Indicators*** |
| 6.  | Quality of assessments  | Student Feedback Alumni Feedback Teacher Feedback | At the end of each course or Semi-annually conducted surveys | Course Evaluations Alumni Surveys Teacher Feedback |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **IQA** **Domain 3** | **No.**  | **IQA Indicator**  | **Indicator Metric**  | **Benchmark**  | **Implementation Method** | **Targets** | **Comments** |
| Research & researcher | ***Performance Indicators*** |  |  |
| 1.  | Strategic framework • Strategic research target • PhD trajectory | Defined research areas/targets No., level and type of research produced by faculty (providing details how the research is relevant for society) Targeted media citations | At least 2 (two) peer-reviewed journal publications in Scopus indexed journals At least 1 (one) conference or workshop or seminar presentation in the last five years by all PhD qualified faculty. Research Awarding Event for faculty & students (at the university) | Policy & procedures |  |  |
| 2.  | Research quality maintenance  | No./type of support measures for staff Events organised for internal dissemination | The presence of research supporting mechanisms Examples • balancing in teaching load for faculty for research activities • financial support for active participation in conferences and research meetings |

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 14 -



|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |  | • support in the acquisition and handling of third-party funded projects • the support of hosting research workshops and conferences at the • the granting of own research funds and scholarships. • the granting of research sabbaticals 1-2 (one-two) events/conferences per year, where staff and students share their research activities. |  |  |  |
| 3.  | Ethical decision-making  | Presence & procedures of ethical committees Ethical considerations in each thesis Presence of documents safeguarding academic integrity | Code of Conduct Code of Ethical Behaviour Ethical Committee |
| 4.  | Research facilities: open science, labs, etc. | No./quality of facilities Access to literature resources articles/publications/books | ICT service, laptop lending Online library access to books, journals, articles: Wiley, Springer, EBSCO, Perlego, Pearson etc. |
| 5.  | Social impact of research  | Research concerned with being involved in professional or civic organisations Research integrating the UN Social Development Goals Research aimed at supporting disadvantaged communities | At least 1 (one) research project together with local HEIs and industry partners every three years. At least 10% final year research projects by students through local/regional industry partners. |

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 15 -



|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  | Research in partnership with other institutions with social impact outcomes Etc. |  |  |
| ***Perceptual Indicators*** |
| 6.  | Quality of research facilities  | Student/teacher feedback  | 1-2 (one) times per year, collecting input from students, teachers and/or alumni | Service Evaluations |

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 16 -



**6 Evaluation methods and corresponding tools based on the Comparative Analysis**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **No.**  | **Evaluation method**  | **Target Group**  | **Content of evaluation**  | **Form of evaluation/tools – at Uni** | **Schedule of evaluation** | **Target** | **Comments** |
| 1.  | **Course Evaluation**  | Students  | The course, the teaching, materials, workload  | Survey – All  | After course completion |  |  |
| Student Committees - WUAS  | Annually  |  |  |
| 2. | **Course Unit** **Evaluation** **(extended)** | Students | A specific course unit evaluation as a result from the general course evaluation | Survey or other forms deemed practical - UG  | n.i. |  |  |
| 3.  | **Programme** **Evaluation**  | Students  | The programme, the programme cohesion, workload, etc.  | Survey – IUBH, UU, UG, TUM  | Semi-annually/Annually |  |  |
| Programme Committees – WUAS, UU, UvA, UG  | Annually  |  |  |
| AoL – UvA, UG, WUAS  | Annually - Rotative |  |  |
| 4. | **Assessment** **Evaluation**  | Teachers/examiners  | Assessment & exams | Moderation - WUAS Periodical reviews – WUAS, UCAM, UG,  | Quarterly or more frequently |  |  |
| 5.  | **Service Evaluation**  | Students  | Study support activities  | Survey – IUBH, TUM  | Semi-annually  |  |  |
| 6. | **Satisfaction with** **cooperating** **business partner** | Students  | Tasks and learning process  | Survey – IUBH  | Semi-annually |  |  |
| 7. | **Feedback on** **studying abroad**  | Students  | Preparation, impressions, courses, teaching and teaching methods used  | Survey – IUBH  | After completion of the study abroad |  |  |
| 8.  | **Alumni Survey**  | Alumni | Graduate prospects, retrospective evaluation of the followed programme | Survey – IUBH, UU, TUM  | 1 year after graduation, subsequently every 3 years |  |  |
| 9. | **Non-graduated** **Survey** | Student who left the university without obtaining a degree | Retrospective evaluation of the followed programme  | Survey - UU  | n. i.  |  |  |

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 17 -



|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 10.  | **Employer Survey**  | Employers  | Dual study system rating, room for improvements & recommendations | Survey – IUBH  | Annually  |  |  |
| 11.  | **Staff Survey**  | Academic & non academic staff  | Staff satisfaction, teaching quality, professional development  | Survey by external agency - UG  | Biennial (every two years) |  |  |
| 12.  | **Teacher Awards**  | Students/Teachers  | Teaching & teaching methods  | Event (jury) - UU  | Annually  |  |  |
| 13. | **Education Fair** **(internal)**  | Students/Teachers  | Teaching & teaching methods, facilities, quality  | Event - UU  | Annually |  |  |
| 14.  | **Ancillary Activities**  | Teachers/Staff  | Professional activities outside the scope of staff’s position  | Survey - UU  | n.i. |  |  |
| 15.  | **Self-assessment**  | Management & staff  | Organisation, programmes, courses, staff, students  | All  | Annually  |  |  |
| 16. | **National Student** **Survey (NSE)4** | Students  | The quality of teaching and facilities.  | Survey- WUAS, UvA, UU and UG  | Annually  |  |  |
| 17. | **National (Alumni) Higher Education Monitor5** **(WO – Monitor)** | Alumni  | Retrospective evaluation of the quality of teaching and facilities.  | Survey – UU, UG  | Biennial (every two years) |  |  |
| 18. | **International** **Student Barometer (ISB)6** | Students  | International university experience  | Survey - UG  | Annually |  |  |

4In the Netherlands, The **National Student Survey (NSE)** is a student feedback system by means of a yearly survey on the degree programmes, conducted on a national level.

5In the Netherlands, **The National (Alumni) Higher Education Monitor (WO monitor or NAE),** conducted by VSNU is an alumni feedback system by means of a biennial survey among recently graduated master and doctorate graduated students.

6 **The International Student Barometer (ISB),** is as its name suggests an international platform where students provide their experiences, which in turn can be used by the university for benchmarking purposes.

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 18 -

**7 References**

1. Nvao.net. 2021.*NVAO*. [online] Available at: <https://www.nvao.net/en> [Accessed 10 January 2021]. https://www.qanu.nl/ 2. Qaa.ac.uk. 2021.*The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education*. [online] Available at: <https://www.qaa.ac.uk/> [Accessed 16 January 2021].

3. ENQA. 2021.*Home • ENQA*. [online] Available at: <https://www.enqa.eu/> [Accessed 10 January 2021]. https://www.qaa.ac.uk/ 4. Ceenqa.org. 2021. *CEENQA – Central and Eastern European Network of Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education*. [online] Available at: <https://www.ceenqa.org/> [Accessed 10 January 2021].https://www.inqaahe.org/

5. Inqaahe.org. 2021. *INQAAHE | International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education*. [online] Available at: <https://inqaahe.org/> [Accessed 13 January 2021].

6. EQAR. 2021.*The European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education - EQAR*. [online] Available at: <https://www.eqar.eu/> [Accessed 15 January 2021].

7. Amsterdam, U., 2021.*University of Amsterdam*. [online] University of Amsterdam. Available at: <https://www.uva.nl/en> [Accessed 15 January 2021].

8. University of Amsterdam. 2012, *Quality Assurance Framework,* University Policy Papers. Available at: Quality assurance - University of Amsterdam (uva.nl) [Accessed 16 January 2021].

9. University of Groningen, 2019-2022, *UG Teaching Quality – Policy memorandum on Educational Quality Management: September 2019- 2020,* Available at: ug-quality-assurance-protocol.pdf (rug.nl), [Accessed 16 January 2021].

10. En-fibaa.org. 2021.*Welcome Page - FIBAA - YOUR PARTNER FOR EXCELLENCE IN HIGHER EDUCATION*. [online] Available at: <https://www.en-fibaa.org/nc/en/welcome-page/> [Accessed 11 January 2021].

11. Vsnu.nl. 2021.*Quality Assurance Research*. [online] Available at: <https://www.vsnu.nl/en\_GB/sep-eng.html> [Accessed 15 January 2021]. 12. WUAS. 2021, *Quality System Handbook, 10 January*

13. Aneca.es. 2021. *VERIFICA - Aneca*. [online] Available at: <http://www.aneca.es/Programas-de-evaluacion/Evaluacion-de-titulos/VERIFICA> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

14. Aneca.es. 2021. *MONITOR - Aneca*. [online] Available at: <http://www.aneca.es/Programas-de-evaluacion/Evaluacion-de titulos/MONITOR> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

15. Aneca.es. 2021. *ACREDITA - Aneca*. [online] Available at: <http://www.aneca.es/Programas-de-evaluacion/Evaluacion-de titulos/ACREDITA> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

16. Aneca.es. 2021. *AUDIT - Aneca*. [online] Available at: <http://www.aneca.es/Programas-de-evaluacion/Evaluacion-institucional/AUDIT> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

17. Aneca.es. 2021. *DOCENTIA - Aneca*. [online] Available at: <http://www.aneca.es/Programas-de-evaluacion/Evaluacion institucional/DOCENTIA> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

18. UCAM. 2021. [online] Available at: <https://www.ucam.edu/sites/default/files/public/grado-turismo/nueva-memoria-de-verificacion-del grado-en-turismo-2019.pdf> [Accessed 14 January 2021].

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 19 -

19. Madrimasd.org. 2021. *Compendio legislativo | madrimasd*. [online] Available at: <http://www.madrimasd.org/fundacion/compendio legislativo> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

20. Sp.upcomillas.es. 2021. [online] Available at: <https://sp.upcomillas.es/comillas/SI

Calidad/Sistema%20Interno%20de%20Garanta%20de%20Calidad/AUDIT/PC-07.pdf> [Accessed 16 January 2021].

21. Sp.upcomillas.es. 2021. [online] Available at: <https://sp.upcomillas.es/comillas/SI

Calidad/Sistema%20Interno%20de%20Garanta%20de%20Calidad/AUDIT/PE-02.pdf> [Accessed 16 January 2021].

22. Sp.upcomillas.es. 2021. [online] Available at: <https://sp.upcomillas.es/comillas/SI

Calidad/Sistema%20Interno%20de%20Garanta%20de%20Calidad/AUDIT/PS-11.pdf> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

23. Sp.upcommillas.es. 2021. [online] Available at: <https://sp.upcomillas.es/comillas/SI

Calidad/Sistema%20Interno%20de%20Garanta%20de%20Calidad/AUDIT/Manual%20de%20Gesti%C3%B3n%20de%20Calidad.pd> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

24. Juarez, P., 2021. *Institutos*. [online] Universidad Pontificia Comillas. Available at:

<https://www.comillas.edu/es/investigacion/investigacion-en-comillas/institutos> [Accessed 15 January 2021].

25. Comillas.edu. 2021. *Centros de la universidad*. [online] Available at: <https://www.comillas.edu/centros-universidad> [Accessed 15 January 2021].

26. García, I., 2021. *Sistema de Gestión de Calidad (AUDIT)*. [online] Universidad Pontificia Comillas. Available at:

<https://www.comillas.edu/es/unidad-de-calidad-y-prospectiva/sistema-de-gestion-de-calidad-audit#SIGC> [Accessed 15 January 2021]. 27. Eurydice - European Commission. 2021.*Quality Assurance in Higher Education - Eurydice - European Commission*. [online] Available at: <https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/quality-assurance-higher-education

25\_en#:~:text=The%20supervision%20of%20higher%20education%20institutions%20is%20exercised,associations%20of%20higher%20edu cation%20institutions%20covering%20all%20L%C3%A4nder.> [Accessed 15 January 2021].

28. Erasmusplus.org.az. 2021. [online] Available at: <http://erasmusplus.org.az/images/uploader/82baa

State%20standards%20and%20programs%20for%20higher%20education\_2010\_ENG.pdf> [Accessed 22 January 2021]. 29. E-qanun.az. 2021.*493-“Təhsil müəssisələrinin akkreditasiyası Qaydaları”nın təsdiq edilməsi haqqında” Azərbaycan Respublikası Nazirlər Kabinetinin 2010-cu il 28 sentyabr tarixli 167 nömrəli Qərarında dəyişiklik edilməsi barədə*. [online] Available at: <http://www.e qanun.az/framework/46460> [Accessed 18 January 2021].

30. E-qanun.az. 2021.*7-“Dövlət və bələdiyyə tərəfindən yaradılan ali təhsil müəssisəsinin Nümunəvi Nizamnaməsi”nin təsdiq edilməsi və “Ali təhsil müəssisəsinin Nümunəvi Nizamnaməsi”nin və “Azərbaycan Respublikası Nazirlər Kabinetinin dəyişiklik edilmiş bəzi qərarlarının siyahısı”nın təsdiq edilməsi haqqında” Azərbaycan Respublikası Nazirlər Kabinetinin 2011-ci il 21 yanvar tarixli 9 nömrəli Qərarında dəyişiklik edilməsi barədə*. [online] Available at: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/41220> [Accessed 18 January 2021].

31. E-qanun.az. 2021. *907-Azərbaycan Respublikası Təhsil Nazirliyinin fəaliyyətinin təkmilləşdirilməsi və “Azərbaycan Respublikasında bir sıra dövlət orqanlarının strukturunun optimallaşdırılması və idarə edilməsinin təkmilləşdirilməsi ilə bağlı əlavə tədbirlər haqqında” Azərbaycan*

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 20 -

*Respublikası Prezidentinin 2019-cu il 17 yanvar tarixli 479 nömrəli Fərmanında dəyişiklik edilməsi barədə*. [online] Available at: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/44056> [Accessed 18 January 2021].

32. E-qanun.az. 2021. *13-“Azərbaycan Respublikasında təhsilin inkişafı üzrə Dövlət Strategiyası”nın təsdiq edilməsi haqqında*. [online] Available at: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/27274> [Accessed 18 January 2021].

33. Edu.gov.az. 2021. *Ministry of Education of Azerbaijan*. [online] Available at: <https://edu.gov.az/en/page/299/2546> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

34. Eua.eu. 2021. [online] Available at:

<https://eua.eu/downloads/content/standards%20and%20guidelines%20for%20quality%20assurance%20in%20the%20european%20high er%20education%20area%20esg%202015.pdf> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

35. Cis-legislation.com. 2021.*Federal Law of the Russian Federation "About education in the Russian Federation"*. [online] Available at: <https://cis-legislation.com/document.fwx?rgn=57340> [Accessed 15 January 2021].

36. Cis-legislation.com. 2021. *Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation "About approval of the Procedure for reception of citizens in educational institutions of the Highest..."*. [online] Available at: <https://cis

legislation.com/document.fwx?rgn=49366> [Accessed 19 January 2021].

37. Essel, Harry & Boakye-Yiadom, Michael & Kyeremeh, Frank. (2018). Assessing Students' Experiences of Internal Quality Assurance Practices in Selected Private Higher Education Institutions. 10.13140/RG.2.2.15131.77605.

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 21 -

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences

© Wittenborg University of Applied Sciences September 2021 Page - 22 -